

Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh
Bangladesh Planning Commission
General Economics Division
Social Security Policy Support (SSPS) Programme

Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of the Committee on M&E for National Social Security Strategy (NSSS)

Chairperson : Dr. Shamsul Alam, Member (Senior Secretary), General
Economics Division
Date & Time : 17 October 2018, 2:30 pm
Place : Nazia-Salma Conference Room (Room-26, Block-06)
Attendance : **Annexure-A**

The Chairperson commenced the meeting with a warm note of welcome to all the participants followed by a brief round of self-introduction. At the very outset, he touched upon the importance and the critical role of a monitoring and evaluation committee for tracking the progress of implementation of any government policies. He commented that the role of such committee becomes more significant when this is a very comprehensive and long-term reform agenda like the National Social Security Strategy (NSSS). He then requested the presence to enjoy the presentations according to the agenda.

Presentations

Summary of the Presentation on Single Registry MIS by Daniel Winstanley, Consultant, SSPS Programme

2. Single Registry MIS adds up two distinct concepts. The first part, Single Registry, refers to a gateway for coordinating registration and eligibility processes for multiple social programs. It combines the processes of outreach, intake and registration, and assessment of needs and conditions to determine potential eligibility for these multiple programs (World Bank, 2017). Management Information System (MIS), the other part of the term, relates to information technology and can be defined as an IT based system that transforms data from a program's database into information that can be used for efficient and effective management. The mandate in the NSSS calls for all individual MISs to be integrated into a central platform and terms it as a Single Registry MIS: "The Government will, therefore, establish a national Single Registry that uses the database from the national identity system and is based on building scheme-specific MISs that communicate with each other and deliver comprehensive information across government.". A new official name might be needed for this system as in social protection discourse a wide number of phrases are used to describe some similar interrelated concepts. The Proposed Single Registry MIS will be linked to the Single Registry of BBS (National Household Database), programme level MIS's of the ministries, Finance Divisions fiscal MIS (IBAS), G2P Cash Transfer system, Grievance Redress System, and a Result Based M&E at GED.



Summary of the Presentation on Single Registry MIS of Finance Division by Mr. Md. Azizul Alam, Additional Secretary

3. A central MIS has been established at Finance Division that captures all the beneficiary data and information relating to payment of their allowances. It has integrated Beneficiaries Database from the line ministry MISs on social protection. It uses NIDs to validate beneficiaries of intra- and inter-ministerial SP schemes. It also performs cross-cutting monitoring and tracks expenditure and facilitates the evaluation and management of SP schemes. It is compatible with iBAS++ for EFT generation and execution. So far, the system has been piloted in the FD and 2 other line ministries.

Summary of the Presentation on National Population Register (NPR) of BBS by Mr. Chandra Shekhar Roy, Senior Maintenance Engineer-IT

4. National Population Register (NPR) includes information (e.g. names, addresses, citizenship, identification numbers, position of employment and civil status of people) about everyone residing in Bangladesh. The NPR will be a comprehensive identity database in the country. This would not only strengthen security of the country but also help in better targeting related to Government schemes/programmes and improve planning. The NPR has two major attributes. First, it requires that for each individual residing on the territory there should be only one file in the register containing his/her personal information: **"one person-one file"**. Secondly, for the purpose of providing access to the data for individuals and other institutions, it is necessary to create conditions for the subsequent multiple use of registered data by electronic means: **"register once – multiple use of information"**. National Household Database and National Population Register both are based on household level data and depends on well-organized geo-code and field map.

Discussion

The Chair requested the participants for their comments and queries.

5. **Additional Secretary (Relief), Ministry of Disaster Management and Relief (MoDMR):** Some Ministries including MoDMR has already instituted MISs related to SP Schemes. In addition to these ministry level MISs, there are some scheme specific MISs for the big programmes. It is imperative that a Single Registry MIS is built to connect all the existing MISs so that duplication is avoided and efficiency is ensured. The big programmes might be included first gradually adding the others.

6. **Additional Secretary (Development), Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MoPME):** MoPME runs the biggest programme in the country distributing Primary School Stipend to 11 million mothers for 13 million children. The ministry has an MIS cell and maintains a database with this huge number of beneficiaries. With the source code these data can be used for various other related purposes in other words they are interoperable.

7. **Director, Computer Wing, Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS):** The preliminary requisite in this regard is baseline information relating to all the households in the country. Presently BBS is preparing a complete database of all households in the country known as National Household Database (NHD). This is based on socioeconomic condition of the HHs. BBS has developed a PMT Scoring System and each HH will be assigned with a PMT Score. The data will be stored in a single registry. Unlike HIES, which give us some estimates based on sample HH, NHD will be an exhaustive list of all the HHs with a PMT Score. The issue arises as a concern is how to link and integrate institutional administrative data and records by ministry or programme level registries with this central data repository. This will come as a big challenge. A study is needed to check compatibility of

the existing and proposed databases with the NHD data. In the end, a mechanism can be developed to ensure interoperability.

8. **National Project Manager, SSPS Programme:** In NHD there will be NID Number and/or Birth Registration Number of individuals. There are some issues with matching and mixing this number as unique identifiers. While initiating a social protection programme to select the beneficiaries, for example in a Union, using the PMT Score of NHD the poor household might be easily identified. The programme sponsoring ministry or agency can go for a check whether these HHs actually are poor. Every programme, then, will come up with some baselines. World Bank developed a guideline that has a separate pointer for assessment that help to understand which programme of what ministry is suitable for this HH or individual. Brazil is using this system. Here the Local Government Institutions (LGIs) assess the programme compatibility of individuals or households and sends the proposal to the ministry or agency which in turn is reflected in the programme level and/or ministry level MIS and consequently included in the Central Single Registry MIS. For this we need to prepare a master plan.

9. **Deputy Secretary, Cabinet Division and Deputy Project Director, SSPS Programme:** One problem with the NHD data collection process is it has been several years BBS is collecting data and data collected in two or three years ago may not be the representation of present situation of HHs. Updated information should be there for every household.

10. **Additional Secretary, Informatics Wing, Statistics and Informatics Division (SID):** SID and BBS are well aware of that NHD data need regular updating. A mechanism will be developed so that data are updated regularly.

11. **Additional Secretary (Development), Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MoPME):** Duplication is sometimes observed in social protection programmes. If in dire need one person may avail benefits from multiple programmes that needed to be checked.

12. **The Chair:** There should be a limit for individuals regarding getting benefits from different programmes. There was a proposal in the CMC that one individual might get benefits from a maximum of three programmes. Instead of one getting from many it is preferable that all eligible persons should get benefits from at least one programme. This should be applicable for cash transfer programmes not for workfare or in-kind support.

13. **Additional Secretary Finance Division:** There is a difference between Single Registry and Social Registry. The one initiated in the Finance Division that integrates scheme specific MISs into a single platform is an example of Single Registry whereas the NPR of BBS is Social Registry fulfilling general needs rather than facilitating social protection programme management.

14. **The Chair:** The central question is do we have one list of all the recipients of social protection benefits? Do we have a central database? One of the main purposes of formulating NSSS was to streamline the social protection programmes that is to avoid duplication. Each ministry should have their own MIS to facilitate their own monitoring and evaluation process. In addition to this differentiated systems we also need a common platform for inter-ministerial coordination. This will minimize duplication, multiplicity, and mis-targeting. One person getting benefits from multiple programmes and many persons are not getting anything from any programme—this must be avoided. Similarly, some well-off people are getting benefits and some poverty ridden persons are deprived—this cannot continue. National level monitoring demands for a single registry. Therefore, each ministry should have its own MIS, they should be interoperable and linked to a central data repository or a Single Registry MIS. To sum up, there might be common but differentiated responsibilities in terms of monitoring and evaluation. We saw in South Africa and Lesotho example of this type of central system. We need a complete list of poor people. We can, then, check who among the poor has been left out to get benefits he/she is eligible for. Graduation record is another important data points to be considered. The present initiatives of BBS, Finance Division and other Ministries are laudable. However, some kind of coordination mechanism is needed. NHD and NPR might complement each other giving



data for individuals and the other for households. Our target is to identify the poor and provide them with social protection benefits.

Decisions

15. After elaborate discussion the following decisions were made:
- a) Actions would be taken to coordinate the Single Registry and Social Registry Initiatives of different ministries and agencies including BBS. There should have synergies among all MISs of the Ministries with central repository of households.
 - b) Communications would be made with concerned BBS officials to take update regarding National Household Data base and request them to take initiatives on releasing the data collected so far. and
 - c) A situation analysis would be undertaken on establishing Single Registry MISs.
16. The meeting concluded with the vote of thanks from the Chair.



(Dr. Shamsul Alam)
Member (Senior Secretary)
General Economics Division
Bangladesh Planning Commission